



Travel Reduction and Outreach

Phone: 602-506-6750

Email: TRP@maricopa.gov

Maricopa.gov/AQ

CleanAirMakeMore.com



Maricopa County Travel Reduction Program (TRP) 2021 Cost Study

Introduction

[Arizona Revised Statutes §49-583](#) reference the responsibility of the Maricopa County TRP Regional Task Force (Task Force) to consider unique circumstances and costs when reviewing an organization's proposed travel reduction plan (plan). Periodic evaluations of average costs help TRP staff address budget concerns during the plan review process and provide a benchmark for the Task Force when assessing whether a plan should be approved.

History

The cost studies from 2010 through 2021 calculated the average cost using budgets for each organization that had a plan approved during a 12-month period. Beginning in 2007, periodic costs studies have been based on average costs for specific industries.

Methodology

Budgets and employee counts were compiled from 1,154 plans that were active during fiscal year 2021. If an organization had two plans approved in that period, the latest submission was used (i.e., a total of 10 plans were excluded, which left 1,144 unique plans). Each organization was also evaluated to determine the industry classification that appeared to best describe the focus of operations at the site(s) covered by the plan.

Total budgets were determined by calculating the annual values stipulated in each section by the organizations. Those sections include drawings, new or frequent participant bonuses, emergency rides, events, preferred car/vanpool parking, subsidies, and other TRP efforts. While some organizations may incur expenses for starting or expanding teleworking and installing and maintaining electric vehicle charging stations (EVCSs) into their plans, ongoing operating and maintenance costs for site amenities (i.e., daycare, bike racks, and showers) are typically not reported in the plan.

In addition to calculating an average cost for the entire set of plans (all TRP employers), data were also sorted by industry to determine the average cost for all 32 distinct industry groups. The average cost per person for all TRP employers is \$16.74.

For the Pre-K to Grade 12 category, the average was calculated using the employee headcount and incentive budget (i.e., the limited funds directed exclusively at driving-age students was extracted). There were two reasons for excluding student data from this category: 1) the plan review for high schools typically focuses on improving employee incentives because their drive-alone rates are usually well-above the student rates and 2) it ensured each organization in the group could reasonably be compared to the entire group (i.e., the efforts of a K-8 district could be measured against a high school district).

For the Higher Education & Training category, funds directed at students were excluded. While plan review for this industry typically focuses on both groups, for the purposes of this study only employees are included to compare all industries alike. Unlike previous years, where funding for student incentives in this category were often embedded with the budgets for employee incentives, TRP staff has made efforts to separate the two budget incentives and calculate all numbers for only employees.

Assumptions

All funds listed in the plan were expended and no labor costs were included. While some final expenditures tend to be below the budgeted amount (i.e., emergency ride home, prizes linked to pollution advisories, new enrollment bonuses), others often exceed the budgeted amount (i.e. subsidies, point programs, events). Although organizations are not required to continue an incentive that has reached its spending limit, many opt to continue in order to maintain continuity, interest, and participation.

Results

The average annual expense for this study was \$16.74 per person (vs. \$24.13 in 2019). Key factors that contributed to the decrease from the 2019 average include ongoing effects of the COVID-19 pandemic, evaluation of subsidy budgets, and new incentives offered to promote continued teleworking on their plans. TRP staff worked closely with Transportation Coordinators to develop realistic and attainable budgets during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Employers in the same industry typically have similar commuting patterns, so the industry average budget will be the benchmark utilized during the plan review process. This allows for employers within the same industry to be compared equitably.

The following table displays the average expense and single occupancy vehicle/miles traveled (SOV/MT) rates by industry. Organizations that rely on low-cost measures (i.e., teleworking, compressed schedules, premium parking, showers) often submit plans that propose limited expenditures. Comparing the SOV/MT rates of those organizations to their peers helps to assess their progress and the possibility for new or enhanced plan incentives for the current program year.

Industry	Cost Per Person	SOV Trip Percentage	SOV Miles Percentage
Admin / Support Services	\$15.99	47.24%	48.51%
Air & Ground Svcs & Support	\$32.20	78.53%	82.99%
Arts/Entertain. Organizations	\$22.63	74.45%	76.27%
Auto/Truck Sales/Service/Parts	\$21.82	87.70%	87.39%
Automation/IT Support,Sales	\$13.12	42.72%	44.99%
City Municipalities	\$27.24	71.92%	71.98%
Cleaning Services	\$8.41	70.29%	75.07%
Consumer Retail	\$5.15	76.92%	79.91%
County, State, Fed. Agencies	\$40.12	70.17%	68.20%
Engineering, Design, Consulting	\$29.35	48.59%	50.06%
Financial Services & Insurance	\$27.09	41.14%	43.79%
Food/Beverage-Process/Handling	\$15.70	70.36%	72.10%
Grocery (Retail)	\$7.52	76.48%	81.19%
Grocery (Wholesale)	\$11.14	68.65%	70.88%
Health Svc Ops (non-hospital)	\$11.93	65.42%	65.17%
Higher Education / Training	\$4.45	43.34%	45.87%
Home, Small Structure Builders	\$9.26	55.29%	53.37%
Hospitality & Recreation	\$42.52	76.86%	77.59%
Hospitals	\$14.36	71.65%	70.95%
Landscaping and Horticulture	\$3.55	69.12%	73.52%
Legal & Accounting Services	\$58.69	48.02%	49.58%
Manufacturing/Design High-Tech	\$14.65	58.77%	60.11%
Manufacturing/Design Low-Tech	\$19.49	71.57%	72.70%
Pre-K thru Grade 12 Schools	\$3.57	80.38%	80.56%
Publication / Printing Services	\$33.01	61.99%	64.41%
Religious & Charitable Organ.	\$16.90	63.81%	62.54%
Restaurants	\$14.70	78.33%	80.31%
Senior & Acute Care / Rehab.	\$14.26	73.70%	74.53%
Specialized Products / Trades	\$21.40	73.77%	74.41%
Trucking, Storage & Transport	\$9.10	81.45%	81.79%
Utilities, Broadcast & Commun.	\$18.57	51.70%	54.29%
Warehousing-Distribution	\$5.39	60.98%	61.52%

* Industry SOV rates were generated using commute analysis data for sites that surveyed between July 2018 and June 2019 (employees only and includes the statistical penalty applied to sites that failed to reach a 60% response rate). The SOV trip rate is calculated by dividing the number of SOV trips by the total trips taken for all commuters. The SOV miles rate is calculated by dividing the number of SOV miles traveled by the total number of miles driven by all commuters. Both of these rates are aggregated for a company (e.g., if an employer has more than one site, the SOV trips are totaled for all sites, then divided by the total trips for the same sites)